

## DEPARTMENT OF PHILOSOPHY Dr. Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan School of Philosophical Studies ASSAM UNIVERSITY, SILCHAR (A Central University constituted under Act XIII of 1989) Silchar-788011, Assam, India Year of Submission: August, 2017

## **DECLARATION**

I, Tapan Talukdar bearing Registration No. Ph. D/1552/2011, dated 20.09.2011, hereby declare that the subject of the thesis entitled, "Experimentations on Sentient Beings: An Ethical Investigation" is the record of work done by me and that the contents of this thesis did not form the basis for award of any degree to me or to anybody else to the best of my knowledge. The thesis has not been submitted previously by me in any other university/ institute.

Place-

Date-

Tapan Talukdar

## **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

I wish to extend my gratitude to the following people. First and foremost, my deepest appreciation goes out to my supervisors, Prof. Subhra Nag, faculty and the Dean, Dr. Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan School of Philosophical Studies, Assam University, Silchar and Dr. Bhaskarjit Neog, faculty of Center for Philosophy, Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi, without whom this thesis would have never seen the light of day. Their intellectual involvement, proficient guidance, academic integrity and moral support throughout the years have made the impossible possible.

I acknowledge my sincere gratitude to Prof. A. Nataraju, the Head, Dept. of Philosophy, AUS and other respected faculty members of the Dept. of Philosophy, Prof. Nirmali Barman, Dr. Pius V Thomas and Munmun Chakraborty for their support and encouragement. I also thank the non-teaching staff and the personnel at the Departmental Library and the Central Library, Assam University, for their constant support and help.

I also acknowledge sincere gratitude to Amar Kr. Nayak, the Head, Dept. of English, Nalbari College, and Dr. Anupam Dutta, faculty of the Dept. of English, Barbhag College for their help throughout my research work. A few other good friends of mine were also of great help to me in the pursuance of my research studies like Dr. Papori Baruah, Dr. Pranab Jyoti Deka, Piyanu Baruah, Arup Sarma and Nirmal Deka.

Heartily I acknowledge the incessant encouragement, inspiration, love and support that I have received from my sisters (Kanika, Gita, Milan & Urmilla) and brothers (Bhuban & Nanda)

who supported and encouraged me throughout the period of my research studies, which made easier the task of completing my thesis in a successful way.

Finally, I wish to recognize the wholehearted support of my mother, Late. Nirala Talukdar and father Late. Dharma Nath Talukdar, whose blessings have helped me in overcoming all the adverse problems which I have had to face during the course of completion of the study.

I dedicated this thesis to the unbounded love and prayers of my Mother and Father.

Dated:

Place:

Tapan Talukdar

## **Contents**

		<u>Page No.</u>
1.	Introduction	(1-13)
	1.1. Basic research question	1-3
	1.2. Ethical issues at hand	3-7
	1.3. Strategy of the work	7-11
	1.4. Methodology	11-12
	1.5. Observations	12
	Notes & references	13
2.	Experimentation on Human Beings: Ethical Concerns	(14 -71)
	2.1. Introduction	14-16
	2.2. Historical background of human experimentation	16-21
	2.3. Types of experimentation	21-22
	2.4. Importance of human experimentation	22-23
	2.4.1. Why experiments?	23
	2.4.2. Benefits towards humanity	23-29
	2.4.3. Contemporary research	30
	2.5. Moral issues concerning human experimentation	30-32
	2.5.1. Sanctity of life	32-37
	2.5.2. Objectification	37-40
	2.5.3. Instrumentalization	40-41
	2.5.4. Denial of autonomy	41-44
	2.6. Critical appraisal: addressing the moral issues	45-46

	2.6.1. Informed consent	46-49
	2.6.2. Doctor's duty to care	49-53
	2.6.3. Well defined ethical principles	53-60
	2.6.4. Institutional mechanism	60-63
	2.7. Conclusion	63-64
	Notes & references	65-71
3.	Experimentation on Non- Human beings: Ethical Concerns	(72-122)
	3.1. Introduction	72-73
	3.2. History of animal experimentations	73-78
	3.3. Importance of animal experimentation	78
	3.3.1. Why experimentation?	78-79
	3.3.2. Value of research on animals	79-82
	3.3.3. Contemporary research	82-84
	3.4. Moral issues concerning animal experimentation	84
	3.4.1. Inflicting unnecessary pain & harm	85-90
	3.4.2. Right to life	91-96
	3.4.3. Denial of subjectivity	96-99
	3.4.4. Ownership	99-102
	3.5. Critical appraisal: addressing the moral issues	102-104
	3.5.1. Respecting sanctity of life	104-107
	3.5.2. Investigator's duty to care	107-109
	3.5.3. Well defined ethical principles	109-112
	3.5.4. Institutional mechanism	112-117

	3.6. Conclusion	117
	Notes & references	118-122
4.	The Question of Moral Status of Sentient Beings	(123 -177)
	4.1. Introduction	123-125
	4.2. What is moral status?	125-126
	4.3. Who has moral status?	127
	4.4. Criteria of moral status	127-128
	4.4.1. Uni-criterial approach	128-139
	4.4.2. Multi-criterial approach	139-146
	4.5. Moral considerations and experimentation	146-154
	4.6. Experimentation with an ethical perspective	154-166
	4.7. Limits of experimentations	166-169
	4.8. Conclusion	169-171
	Notes & references	172-177
5.	Conclusion	(178-194)
	5.1. Concluding remarks	178
	5.2. Highlights of the work	178-187
	5.3. The ethical stance	187-190
	5.4. Shortcomings	190-191
	5.5. Way forward	191-193
	Notes & references	194
	Select bibliography	(195-210)