



**DEPARTMENT OF PHILOSOPHY**  
**Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan School of Philosophy**  
**ASSAM UNIVERSITY, SILCHAR**  
Silchar-788011, Assam  
Year of Submission: October, 2016

---

---

## **DECLARATION**

I, *Bikash Bhargab Sarma*, do hereby declare that my Ph.D. research work entitled *“From the Concept of Autonomy to the Ethics of Responsibility: An Enquiry into the Nature of Ethical Reflectivity on Human Cloning”*, submitted to Assam University, for the partial fulfillment of Ph.D. degree, is the result of investigation carried out by me under the guidance and supervision of Dr. Pius V. Thomas, Department of Philosophy, Assam University, Silchar.

I further declare that this Ph.D. research work has not been previously submitted by me or others either in this or any other University/ Institute for any degree or diploma or fellowship.

Place: Silchar, Assam

**(BIKASH BHARGAB SARMA)**

Date:

## Acknowledgements

Gratefully I acknowledge my utmost gratitude to the unassuming and unconditional help that I have received from my teachers, friends and benefactors at various stages of realizing the study and writing the thesis.

First and foremost I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my Supervisor and Guide Dr. Pius V Thomas, The Department of Philosophy, Assam University, for his constant guidance, intellectual, theoretical and conceptual involvement in the study, without which the study could not have been completed. It is his selfless guidance and support that inspired me in successfully completing my doctoral work.

I express sincere thanks to Prof. Adarsupally Nataraju, Head, Department of Philosophy and Dean, S. R. School of Philosophy, and other faculty members of the Department, Dr. Subhra Nag, Prof. Nirmali Barman and Mrs. Munmun Chakraborty. I also extend my heartfelt thanks to all my esteemed colleagues of the Department of Philosophy, Gurucharan College, Silchar, for their continuous support throughout the study. I also thankfully acknowledge Dr. Prasenjit Biswas, Associate Professor of Philosophy, North Eastern Hill University, Shillong, who initiated some basic ideas about my study and encouraged me to go forward with the study in the initial stages.

I am extremely grateful to all the non-teaching staff members of the Department of Philosophy, AUS. I am also sincerely thankful to the Librarian and staff of the Central Libraries of Assam University, Silchar, North Eastern Hill University, Shillong, Gauhati University, Guwahati, National Institute of Advance Study, Bangalore, Indian Institute of advance Studies, Shimla, Indian Council for Philosophical Research, Lakhnow, University of Poona, Pune, Banaras Hindu University, Banaras for allowing me to access their library during my visit which enabled me to enhance the vision and scope of my research work.

I acknowledge the incessant encouragement, inspiration, support and love that I have received from my wife Smt. Pranita Devi, Bagmita, my daughter, and son Anurag, whose kind co-operation and company inspired me to complete the work in a comfortable manner. I also express my sincere thanks to my younger brother Mr. Gautam Bhargab, whose sharp and transparent advice always enlightened my study.

Last but not least, I most sincerely wish to thank all the wonderful people, whose names are not mentioned here, who supported and encouraged me beyond words and made my doctoral study and thesis an enriching endeavor.

I dedicate my study to my loving parents, Mr. Nabin Chandra Sarma and Mrs. Mina Devi, whom I consider, are my first teachers and the greatest inspirers of my life.

Place: Silchar

(Bikash Bhargab sarma)

Date:

# Contents

	Page No.
Certificate	
Declaration	
Acknowledgements	
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1-16</b>
0.1 Cloning/Human Cloning: The Scenario	1
0.2 Human Cloning and Religious Concerns	2
0.3 Human Cloning and the Ethical Concern	3
0.4 The Scope of the Present Study	5
0.5 Justification of the Study	6
0.6. The Objectives of the Study	8
0.7. Methodology	8
0.8. The Course of Argument Developed in Chapters	8
0.9. Towards the Conclusion of the Study	14
<i>Notes and References</i>	15
<b>Chapter I</b>	
<b>Human Cloning and the Ethical Frameworks</b>	<b>17-71</b>
1.1. Introduction	17
1.2. Cloning: A Brief Overview	17
1.3. History of Cloning	19
1.4. Human Cloning	21
1.5. Different Types of Cloning	23
1.5.1. Embryo Cloning	23
1.5.2. Reproductive Cloning or Adult DNA Cloning	24
1.5.3. Therapeutic Cloning or Bio-medical Cloning	24
1.6. Human Cloning: The Ethical and Moral challenges	26
1.7. Human Cloning: Different Opinions	32
1.7.1. Reproductive Cloning	33
1.7.2. Therapeutic Cloning	35

1.8.	Morality: An Overview	39
1.9.	Concept of Ethics: An Overview	40
1.10.	Different Ethical Frameworks	42
1.10.1.	Virtue Ethics	43
1.10.2.	Consequentialism (Utilitarianism)	53
1.10.3.	Deontological (Kantian)	59
1.11.	Concluding Observation	66
	<i>Notes and References</i>	69

## **Chapter II**

	<b>Ethics and the Concept of Autonomy</b>	<b>72-125</b>
2.1.	Introduction	72
2.2.	Autonomy: Its Definition and Principle	73
2.3.	Different Conceptions of Autonomy	76
2.3.1	Moral Autonomy	76
2.3.2.	Existentialist Autonomy	77
2.3.3.	Personal Autonomy	79
2.3.4.	Autonomy as a Right	81
2.4.	Concept of Autonomy in Philosophy: A Historical Overview	81
2.4.1.	Ethics and Autonomy as Moral Reflectivity	86
2.5.	Concept of Bioethics: An Overview	97
2.5.1.	Bioethics and Concept of Autonomy	110
2.6.	Autonomy Justification and Human Cloning	119
2.7.	Concluding Observation	121
	<i>Notes and References</i>	123

## **Chapter III**

	<b>The Autonomy Question and the Concept of Human Nature</b>	<b>126-181</b>
3.1.	Introduction	126
3.2.	Concept of Autonomy in Moral Philosophy	126
3.3.	Autonomy in Bioethics	129
3.4.	Human Nature: An Overview	136
3.5.	Different Theories of Human Nature	141

3.5.1	Greek View of Human Nature	142
3.5.2.	Religious Thought on Human Nature: (Judo-Christian Tradition)	147
3.5.3.	Rationalist View of Human Nature	149
3.5.4.	Descartes View of Human Nature	150
3.5.5.	Empiricist View of Human Nature	153
3.5.6.	European Enlightenment and Human Nature	155
3.5.7.	Kantian Thought on Human Nature	155
3.5.8.	Existentialist View of Human Nature	156
3.5.8.1.	Jean Paul Sartre	158
3.5.8.2.	Frederich Nietzsche	162
3.5.9.	Marxian View of Human Nature	162
3.5.10.	Human Nature and Modern Empirical Science	169
3.5.11.	Modern Science's Concept of Human Nature	172
3.6.	Concluding Observation	175
	<i>Notes and References</i>	179

## **Chapter IV**

	<b>The Concept of Metaphysically Grounded Human Nature</b>	<b>182-245</b>
4.1.	Introduction	182
4.2.	Metaphysics: An Overview	182
4.3.	Metaphysics: Grand Designs	186
4.3.1	Pre-Socratic Concept of Metaphysics	187
4.3.2	Socrates and Plato's Concept of Metaphysics	188
4.3.3	Aristotle's Concept of Metaphysics	188
4.3.4	Rationalism and Metaphysics	190
4.3.5	Empiricism and Metaphysics	192
4.3.6	Kant's View of Metaphysics	194
4.3.7	Positivists View of Metaphysics	200
4.3.8	Logical Positivism and Metaphysics	202
4.3.9	Phenomenologist and Existentialists View of Metaphysics	207
4.3.10.	Modern Science and Metaphysics	208
4.4.	Metaphysically Grounded Human Nature	213
4.4.1.	Greek Metaphysics of Human Nature	214

4.4.2. Rationalist Metaphysics of Human Nature	218
4.4.3. Empiricist Metaphysics of Human Nature	224
4.4.4. Enlightenment View of Metaphysics of Human Nature	228
4.4.5. Kantian Thought on Human Nature	232
4.4.6. Modern Empirical Science on Human Nature	234
4.5. Concluding Observation	241
<i>Notes and References</i>	243

## **Chapter V**

### **Towards an Ethics of Responsibility 246-292**

5.1. Introduction	246
5.2. Ethical Problems of Human Cloning in a Nutshell	246
5.3. Autonomy Question and Justifying Human Cloning, Concerns	258
5.4. Metaphysics: At a Glance	265
5.5. Postmetaphysical Arguments of Habermas	266
5.5. 1. Habermas' Theory of Truth as Knowledge	271
5.5. 2. Habermas' Discourse Theory of Ethics	273
5.5.3. Habermas' Idea of Human Nature and Autonomy	281
5.5.4. Habermas' Postmetaphysical Consideration of Human Cloning	283
5.6. Concluding Observation	286
<i>Notes and References</i>	290

## **Chapter VI**

### **Conclusion: The Intent of the Ethics of Responsibility 293-299**

6.1. Introduction	293
6.2. The Route: Challenging the Concept of Autonomy	294
6.3. The Decisive Turn: The Postmetaphysical Standpoint	295
6.4. The Destination: The Ethics of Responsibility	296
<i>Notes and References</i>	299

### **Bibliography 300-312**